From:

"Benjamin Gresham" <BGresham@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au>

Date:

Monday, 13 February 2017 9:54 AM

To:

<caladines@optusnet.com.au>

Cc:

"Kevin Kuo" <KKuo@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au>

Subject:

Planning Proposal - 235-237 Marsden Rd Carlingford - RZ/25/2016

Hi Allan,

Just a quick update – I have received some of the referral comments from internal stakeholders and expect to receive the remaining comments by this week.

One of the comments received related to the proposed increase in traffic and the need for a median strip in the centre of Marsden Road, to further restrict right turn ingress/egress. Has the RMS been consulted regarding this proposal?

Also, are you intending to provide a letter of offer for a voluntary planning agreement for this planning proposal?

Kind regards,

Ben Gresham | Project Officer - Land Use Planning

City of Parramatta

PO Box 32, Parramatta NSW 2124

(02) 9806 5088

□ bgresham@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au

Links | www.cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au





From:

"Benjamin Gresham" <BGresham@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au>

Date:

Monday, 13 March 2017 4:34 PM

To:

"Allan Caladine" <caladines@optusnet.com.au>

Cc:

"Kevin Kuo" < KKuo@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au>; "Dennis Wimmer" < dennis@architex.com.au>;

"Bigpond" <noleary@bigpond.net.au>; "Robert Del Pizzo" <robert@architex.com.au>

Subject:

Re: Planning Proposal - 235-237 Marsden Rd Carlingford - RZ/25/2016

Hi Allan,

Thanks for your email.

An update on the Planning Proposal:

- We have received all internal comments and the assessment of the Planning Proposal is going well.
- The key issue at this stage is the proposed land use and whether or not Council is willing to support
 the rezoning. This is largely due to the precedent the Planning Proposal could set within the area.
 However, this is not a straightforward matter and will need to be considered within the wider
 context.
- I am meeting with Senior staff in the next couple of weeks to discuss the Planning Proposal and the way forward. Following that meeting, I will be able to provide another update and we can organise at that time to have a meeting to discuss any relevant issues, including the VPA matter.
- At this stage, I am still on track to report the Planning Proposal to the IHAP (Independent Hearing and Assessment Panel) Meeting on 18 April.

Please give me a call if you would like to discuss the above.

Kind regards,

Ben Gresham | Project Officer - Land Use Planning

City of Parramatta

PO Box 32, Parramatta NSW 2124

(02) 9806 5088

<u>bgresham@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au</u>

Links | www.cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au





From: Allan Caladine [mailto:caladines@optusnet.com.au]

Sent: Thursday, 9 March 2017 5:46 PM

To: Benjamin Gresham

Cc: Kevin Kuo; Dennis Wimmer; Bigpond; Robert Del Pizzo

Subject: TRIM: Re: Planning Proposal - 235-237 Marsden Rd Carlingford - RZ/25/2016

Benjamin,

Hi.

Thankyou for your email concerning this matter.

I have spoken with my clients and my instructions are to advise Council that they wish to work with Council on all matters relevant to this Planning Proposal (PP) and are open to discuss entering into a VPA with Council, including the provision of a formal letter of offer.

However, notwithstanding such, my clients believe that the intent of their PP is quite unique to most others because their site is afforded existing use rights and the proposal seeks to remove a large commercial building within a predominantly low to medium density residential neighbourhood, allowing the site to be developed in a more sympathetic manner, having regards to the well established residential character of this neighbourhood.

We see the extinguishment of existing use rights on this land as being a public benefit.

We would hope that Council recognises this aspect as part of any letter of offer my clients choose to make.

Regards,

Allan Caladine Town Planning Consultant

Caladines Town Planning Pty Ltd 1 Lynbrook Court Castle Hill NSW 2154 Ph (02) 96597211 Fax (02) 96597244 0413 597 295 Email: caladines@optusnet.com.au

From: Benjamin Gresham

Sent: Wednesday, February 22, 2017 9:00 AM

To: Allan Caladine

Cc: Kevin Kuo ; Dennis Wimmer ; Bigpond ; Robert Del Pizzo

Subject: RE: TRIM: Re: Planning Proposal - 235-237 Marsden Rd Carlingford - RZ/25/2016

Hi Allan,

Consultation with RMS prior to Gateway is probably not necessary for this Planning Proposal.

I'm still waiting on some internal comments. However, comments have been received from our Heritage Advisor who has not raised any objections to this proposal from a heritage perspective.

In regards to the VPA, I have attached a copy of Council's policy on the matter. It is noted that the Planning Proposal has not indicated an intention to enter into a Voluntary Planning Agreement to provide public benefit associated with the proposal. The Planning Proposal is seeking a rezoning of the land for higher density residential development and an increase in height and floor space ratio on the site. Therefore it may be appropriate to provide a letter of offer for a VPA. It should be noted that in accordance with Council's VPA policy, formal negotiation of a VPA may not occur prior to a letter of offer from a landowner or representative and a subsequent Council resolution to commence negotiation.

Please give me a call if you have any questions or would like to discuss.

Kind regards,

Ben Gresham | Project Officer – Land Use Planning

City of Parramatta PO Box 32, Parramatta NSW 2124

(02) 9806 5088

<u>bgresham@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au</u>

Links | www.cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au

outcome on the site particularly around size and location that are few and far between in this locality. I will be discussing this with Kevin, and will seek the best way to apply the directions in the Draft Residential Development Strategy pertaining to development outside of centres (and the 'precedent issue') and will advise you accordingly on what the recommendations will be.

Notwithstanding the above, I have begun a skeleton report, and I am of the view to take this proposal to the IHAP meeting in August (noting we will be in caretaker mode, any recommendation to proceed would not be considered by Council until October).

Thanks, Beau

Beau Reid | Student Project Officer Land Use Planning

City Strategy | City of Parramatta PO Box 32, Parramatta NSW 2124

(02) 9806 5538

<u>breid@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au</u>

 Links | www.cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au

In office: Monday, Tuesday, Thursday



From: Beau Reid

Sent: Tuesday, 6 June 2017 9:38 AM

To: 'Allan Caladine' < <u>caladines@optusnet.com.au</u>> **Cc:** Kevin Kuo < <u>KKuo@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au</u>>

Subject: HPRM: RE: Planning Proposal - Economic Assessment - 235-237 Marsden Rd Carlingford - Swanes

Plant Nursery

Hi Allan,

Yes – you are correct that I am now taking carriage of this Planning Proposal over from Ben Gresham. I'm also aware of the issue pertaining to precedent in rezoning this site R3 and the inconsistencies with the 2006 Residential Strategy, so I was expecting this report – thank you very much for forwarding it onto me.

I will be reviewing the report and discussing this with my Team Leader at the earliest opportunity and will provide comments in due course.

Also, as I am sure you are aware from the Tucks Road Planning Proposal, there are implications in relation to reporting timeframes in relation to the end of Council Administration in September.

REPORTING OF PLANNING PROPOSAL TO IHAP AND COUNCIL

Council will not be making any major planning decisions following the July Council meeting of 2017, as the Administrator will be in 'caretaker mode' following the July meeting in preparation for Council elections occurring in September 2017.

Council meetings will continue to be held, but it is anticipated that the consideration of major decisions (e.g. Planning Proposals) will resume in October (at the earliest), once the new Council is re-instated. For a matter to be considered at the July Council meeting (i.e. the last meeting prior to 'caretaker mode'), a report would need to be presented to the IHAP meeting in June (all PPs are sent to IHAP before

consideration for Gateway endorsement by Council).

Given that this proposal will require review of the Economic Feasibility Assessment, I must advise that this proposal, which may make an IHAP meeting prior to the new Council meeting being instated in September, will not have a Council decision being made until after the Council elections of September 2017.

I look forward to working with you on this proposal, Allan. If I can be of any assistance, please don't hesitate to get in contact.

Thanks, Beau

Beau Reid | Student Project Officer Land Use Planning

City Strategy | City of Parramatta PO Box 32, Parramatta NSW 2124

(02) 9806 5538

<u>breid@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au</u>

 Links | www.cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au

In office: Monday to Thursday



From: Allan Caladine [mailto:caladines@optusnet.com.au]

Sent: Monday, 5 June 2017 5:28 PM

To: Beau Reid < BReid@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au >

Cc: Kevin Kuo < KKuo@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au >; Bigpond < noleary@bigpond.net.au >; Nuala (Sydney)

O'leary < Nuala.oleary@WorleyParsons.com >; colm.swanes@gmail.com; Dennis Wimmer

<dennis@architex.com.au>

Subject: Fw: Planning Proposal - Economic Assessment - 235-237 Marsden Rd Carlingford - Swanes Plant Nursery

Beau,

Hi.

I understand that you now have carriage of this PP and have been advised of the precedent issue raised by Council.

It was suggested that the proposal may set a planning precedent for this neighbourhood, encouraging other land owners to consolidate their lots in order to have their land rezoned to permit townhouses.

As a result of such issue being raised, my client engaged the services of MacroPlanDimasi to undertake an Economic Feasibility Assessment to demonstrate that such proposition would not occur.

Please find attached a copy of their final report.

Should you need anything further or need to discuss anything within, please donot hesitate to contact me.

Regards,

From: "Beau Reid" <BReid@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au>

Date: Wednesday, 28 June 2017 11:58 AM

To: "Allan Caladine" <caladines@optusnet.com.au>

Subject: RE: Planning Proposal - Economic Assessment - 235-237 Marsden Rd Carlingford - Swanes Plant

Nursery

Hi Allan,

The Parramatta Residential Development Strategy is the 2006 strategy that Ben originally referred to that set the 'precedent issue' that is in contention. Apologies, it shouldn't have had the "Draft" word attached to it

I am referring to that document in my consideration (Section 2.9 of the document) and the design and planning principles it refers to in consideration of the sites it lists to be considered for upzoning, and how these could apply to the Swane's Nursery site to create a balanced argument for and against the proposal when I make a recommendation, as the primary issue for this proposal is purely land use compatibility outside of a strategic centre.

I note the Economic Feasibility Assessment makes commentary about the unique nature/opportunity of the site (that it is argued would make another development like this unlikely), and the locational/design advantages of the scheme for reasons similar to those listed in the Strategy.

Happy to discuss.

Thanks, Beau

2.9 Housing opportunities in areas outside study areas

All residential land outside study areas will be downzoned, with the exception of the areas and sites outlined below, which will be either upzoned to allow for higher density residential development or have no change to the permitted density of residential development (i.e. allow a continuation of higher density housing).

Sites to be considered for upzoning

Whilst the more sustainable "concentrated" approach to residential development is being pursued, several sites outside the study areas have been identified, by virtue of size, configuration and location as warranting consideration for residential development. These sites are:

- Morton Street Precinct, Parramatta
- Channel Seven Studios, Mobbs Lane, Epping
- No. 2A Gregory Place, Harris Park, and
- No. 260 Victoria Road, Parramatta

Higher density residential development is not currently permitted at these sites, however, Council wishes to explore residential development capacity because

 they are of a size and configuration that offers design flexibility for quality residential development

- they are either well-positioned or of a size that can offer an element of self-containment (eg, through establishment of shops and other uses on site)
- their size suggests a capacity to influence establishment or upgrading to transport corridors, and
- residential development is a more logical use of the site than the current land use in the context of the local land use pattern.

Beau Reid | Student Project Officer Land Use Planning

City Strategy | City of Parramatta PO Box 32, Parramatta NSW 2124

(02) 9806 5538

<u>breid@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au</u>

 Links | www.cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au

In office: Monday, Tuesday, Thursday



From: Allan Caladine [mailto:caladines@optusnet.com.au]

Sent: Tuesday, 27 June 2017 5:36 PM

To: Beau Reid <BReid@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au>

Subject: Re: Planning Proposal - Economic Assessment - 235-237 Marsden Rd Carlingford - Swanes Plant

Nursery

Beau,

Hi.

What is the Draft Residential Development Strategy you refer to.

Allan

From: Beau Reid

Sent: Tuesday, June 27, 2017 4:09 PM

To: Allan Caladine

Subject: RE: Planning Proposal - Economic Assessment - 235-237 Marsden Rd Carlingford - Swanes Plant

Nursery

Hi Allan,

Just to provide you an update on the assessment for 235-237 Marsden Road, Carlingford – apologies that there has been some delay with a huge number of pressing projects going on here over the past two weeks so my response was slower than I would have liked.

I have completed a review of the Economic Feasibility Assessment to discuss with Kevin this week. I note the around the feasibility of development under existing controls as well as the particular advantages for this

From:

"Beau Reid" <BReid@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au>

Date:

Tuesday, 25 July 2017 4:37 PM

To:

"Allan Caladine" <caladines@optusnet.com.au>

Subject:

RE: Planning Proposal - Economic Assessment - 235-237 Marsden Rd Carlingford - Swanes Plant

Nursery

Hi Allan.

I have read and factored in your submission in relation to the previous LEP (2001), particularly pertaining to Clause 30. I accept the principles behind this and the applicability for this site.

However, there is some concern still regarding precedent that I have asked our Property Services Team to review some of the hurdle rate assumptions regarding the profitability of the proposal under the 'base case' in providing for dual occupancy development within existing controls.

We need to ensure that if we are to recommend for a re-zoning on this site, we are able to do so noting the special circumstances of the site and its size, scale and position and with relative surety that it is not repeated elsewhere .

There is some concern that if sites were to amalgamate (i.e. a homeowner with whom owns a property buys an adjacent site and wishes to develop townhouses, similar to 239 Marsden Road) may be pursued by others in the locality, if feasible.

While the Economic Feasibility Assessment addresses this, I am seeking an internal position on this to support, or otherwise, before I can progress with a report to IHAP.

I will keep you updated as I am meeting with our Property team this week.

Thanks,

Beau

Beau Reid | Student Project Officer Land Use Planning

City Strategy | City of Parramatta PO Box 32, Parramatta NSW 2124

(02) 9806 5538

oxdots breid@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au

Links | www.cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au

In office: Monday, Tuesday, Thursday



From: Allan Caladine [mailto:caladines@optusnet.com.au]

Sent: Tuesday, 25 July 2017 2:02 PM

To: Beau Reid <BReid@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au>

Cc: Bigpond <noleary@bigpond.net.au>; Dennis Wimmer <dennis@architex.com.au>

Subject: Re: Planning Proposal - Economic Assessment - 235-237 Marsden Rd Carlingford - Swanes Plant

Nursery

Beau,

of \$20M has been allowed for site preparation and services including internal roads.

• The above assessment has used the rate of \$1,500,000 (34) per duplex development. This value sits within the range provided by the applicant of \$1,347,500 (48) & \$1,633,043 (23).

General Comments

- This report is a desk top analysis of the applicant's feasibility assessment.
- There are additional sites that are of comparable nature in both the R2 & R3 that have not been included in the applicant's feasibility analysis.
- Comparable sites of a similar size have not been included or assessed in the applicant's feasibility of market evidence.
- The accuracy of the estimated parking provisions has not been considered, however it is noted that the applicant has included costs for the provision of parking in their construction cost estimates.
- Amending the zoning from R2 to R3 would have the effect of increasing the site value by at least
 45% from say \$16.9 M (@ \$1,300m²) to \$24.7M (@ \$1,900m²) unimproved. This does not take into consideration the additional FSR that the R3 zone would additionally provide.
- One of the major factors affecting this assessment is the value attributed by the applicant of \$20 Million dollars for the preparation of the site and for site services and internal road network. No details have been attributed towards the estimated cost of \$20Million which seems excessive and high. For the purposes of this report the applicant's estimated \$20M development cost has been used.

I look forward to discussing the matter further with you at our meeting scheduled for Monday 23 October 2017 and next steps.

Regards

Kevin Kuo | Team Leader - Strategic Land Use Planning

City of Parramatta PO Box 32, Parramatta NSW 2124

2 (02) 9806 5834





From: Allan Caladine [mailto:caladines@optusnet.com.au]

Sent: Thursday, 19 October 2017 5:15 PM

To: Kevin Kuo < KKuo@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au>

Subject: Re: CONFIRMED - Meeting with Applicant - 235-237 Marsden Rd, Carlingford

Kevin,

Are you able to tell me what your property people are asking for.

Allan

From: Kevin Kuo

Sent: Thursday, October 19, 2017 4:59 PM **To:** Robert Cologna; caladines@optusnet.com.au

Subject: CONFIRMED - Meeting with Applicant - 235-237 Marsden Rd, Carlingford

Meeting at City of Parramatta Council Offices

Please sign in at Corporate Reception Level 12, 126 Church Street, Parramatta and ask for me.

Regards

Kevin Kuo | Team Leader - Strategic Land Use Planning

City of Parramatta

PO Box 32, Parramatta NSW 2124

(02) 9806 5834

⋈ kkuo@parracity.nsw.gov.au

Links | www.parracity.nsw.gov.au





From: "Allan Caladine" <caladines@optusnet.com.au>

Date: Wednesday, 25 October 2017 3:38 PM

Subject: Fw: CONFIRMED - Meeting with Applicant - 235-237 Marsden Rd, Carlingford

From: Kevin Kuo

Sent: Friday, October 20, 2017 12:35 PM

To: Allan Caladine

Cc: Robert Cologna; Beau Reid

Subject: RE: CONFIRMED - Meeting with Applicant - 235-237 Marsden Rd, Carlingford

Hi Allan,

Overall comments:

As discussed with you previously, Council officers acknowledge that the character of the area is not consistent given there a mix of low and medium density residential in the area. In particular the existing town house/villa development is a result of previously superseded LEP provisions that had permitted town house and villa development on sites greater than 2000m2 within low density residential zones.

The Draft Residential Development Strategy 2006 which informed the preparation of the current PLEP 2011 had sought to concentrate growth in centres and specific areas but residential zones outside of these areas to be downzoned or remain low density (which includes the subject site). Notwithstanding, should Council seek to support your proposal to rezone to R3, Council officers have significant concerns that this would have the effect of encouraging sites within the broader precinct to develop town houses without the strategic justification to upzone the wider area.

The Feasibility Assessment prepared by Macro Plan Dimasi on behalf of your client provides a feasibility assessment and analysis of various scenarios (current proposal – 48 medium density dwellings vs development under the existing FSR and height – 23 dwellings) for the subject site rather than deal with the abovementioned precedent issue that is likely to ensue. It is the conclusion of Macro Plan report that the required 'hurdle rate' (15%) will not be achieved and therefore would not be feasible unless the site is up zoned. These assumptions and modelling have since been tested by Council's property team and based on their analysis it would appear that the development under the current FSR and heights for the purposes of subdivision in to 600m2 and development of dual occupancy would result in a feasible development outcome. This is discussed in detail in the next section.

Valuation/Feasibility Assessment - Under Current R2 zoning (carried out by Council's Property Team)

Zoning R2

FSR 0.5:1

Height Limit 9 m

Total Site Area 13,000 m²

Development Yield

(Site 13,000m² less 20 % services and landscaping = 10,400m²)

 $(10,400\text{m}^2 / 600\text{m}^2 = 17 \text{ lots} = 34 \text{ duplexes})$

34 x duplexes @ \$1,500,000 per duplex

Total Revenue \$51 M

Development Cost \$24.1 M -

Total Development Profit \$26.9 M

Estimated land value (@ \$1300m) \$16.9 M

Therefore

\$51M - \$41M (Dev Cost + Land Value) = \$10 M

The \$10 M represents a return of approximately 20%

Hurdle Rate Achieved 20% approx.

Assessment Considerations

- There has been no detailed design prepared in regards to the proposed site 'layout' to determine the configuration of the proposed development
- The data used has been primarily sourced from the applicant's feasibility assessment.
- The figures may be magnified as a result of the limited 'inputs' in the assessment model.
- There is limited information in regards to the construction costs and it is assumed that the amount
 of \$20M has been allowed for site preparation and services including internal roads.
- The above assessment has used the rate of \$1,500,000 (34) per duplex development. This value sits within the range provided by the applicant of \$1,347,500 (48) & \$1,633,043 (23).

General Comments

- This report is a desk top analysis of the applicant's feasibility assessment.
- There are additional sites that are of comparable nature in both the R2 & R3 that have not been included in the applicant's feasibility analysis.
- Comparable sites of a similar size have not been included or assessed in the applicant's feasibility of market evidence.
- The accuracy of the estimated parking provisions has not been considered, however it is noted that the applicant has included costs for the provision of parking in their construction cost estimates.
- Amending the zoning from R2 to R3 would have the effect of increasing the site value by at least
 45% from say \$16.9 M (@ \$1,300m²) to \$24.7M (@ \$1,900m²) unimproved. This does not take into consideration the additional FSR that the R3 zone would additionally provide.
- One of the major factors affecting this assessment is the value attributed by the applicant of \$20
 Million dollars for the preparation of the site and for site services and internal road network. No
 details have been attributed towards the estimated cost of \$20Million which seems excessive and
 high. For the purposes of this report the applicant's estimated \$20M development cost has been
 used.

I look forward to discussing the matter further with you at our meeting scheduled for Monday 23 October 2017 and next steps.

Regards

Kevin Kuo | Team Leader - Strategic Land Use Planning

City of Parramatta

PO Box 32, Parramatta NSW 2124

(02) 9806 5834

⋈ kkuo@parracity.nsw.gov.au

Links | www.parracity.nsw.gov.au





From: Allan Caladine [mailto:caladines@optusnet.com.au]

Sent: Thursday, 19 October 2017 5:15 PM

To: Kevin Kuo < KKuo@cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au>

Subject: Re: CONFIRMED - Meeting with Applicant - 235-237 Marsden Rd, Carlingford

Kevin,

Are you able to tell me what your property people are asking for.

Allan

From: Kevin Kuo

Sent: Thursday, October 19, 2017 4:59 PM

To: Robert Cologna; caladines@optusnet.com.au

Subject: CONFIRMED - Meeting with Applicant - 235-237 Marsden Rd, Carlingford

Meeting at City of Parramatta Council Offices

Please sign in at Corporate Reception Level 12, 126 Church Street, Parramatta and ask for me.

Regards

Kevin Kuo | Team Leader - Strategic Land Use Planning

City of Parramatta PO Box 32, Parramatta NSW 2124

(02) 9806 5834



